

Review of ‘Imamate Caliphate’ and the Emphasis of Appointment from the Perspective of Reason and Narration

Mahin Keramtifard¹

Abstract

The issue of the divine appointment of Imamate and Caliphate is one of the most fundamental differences between the Shia and the Sunni Muslims, which has many rational and narrative reasons. The significance of this issue in the Muslim world is so much that if it had been done in accordance with divine will, one could accept that among the divine religions, the religion of Islam would have had the least disputes. The Sunnis do not use a coherent method in the field of Imamate and Caliphate and their beliefs in this regard are contradictory. In general, they believe that Imamate and leadership are not the principles of religion, but they are a subcategory of religion. They do not consider a significant religious and ideological position for them, they describe the caliph as the religious ruler of the Islamic Ummah and reject the evidence based on rational and narrative reasons. According to Shia beliefs, Imamate and caliphate are divine positions and one of the five principles in the religion of Islam. They argue that Imamate is like prophecy, is a divine position that God Almighty should determine the Imam. The results of this article also show that the two main denominations of Islam (Shia and Sunni) have basic differences in terms of Imamate and caliphate. According to the rational arguments (the arguments of grace, the ultimate cause, higher possibility and comprehensive manifestation proof) and the narrative arguments (inference from the explicit verses of the Holy Qur'an), including the verses of (propagation, perfection of religion and disappointment of disbelievers and Velayat and Oli al-Amr" and "Hadith of Mazilat, Hadith of Thaqalain and Hadith of Ghadir" the divine appointment of Imamate and caliphate could be proved by rational and narrative reasons.

Key words: *Imamate, caliphate, divine appointment of Imamate, reason, narration*

I. Introduction

Problem: The issue of leadership has always been important in human society in such a way that it has a large chapter in the knowledge of humanity. The occurrence of conflicts and wars is a proof of this issue throughout

¹ Department of philosophy and Islamic theology, faculty of humanities, Malayer University, Malayer, Iran Email: keramati@malayeru.ac.ir

human history. In the religion of Islam, the subject of "leadership" as "province and Imamate" is considered as very important and different jurisprudential, Quranic, historical, theological and philosophical issues have been raised by various Islamic scholars. In fact, the issues of "Imamate and Leadership" and Imamate as in that the successors are the spiritual descendants of the Prophet of Islam (Islam) is considered to be one of the most important issues of belief in Islam. So far, numerous wars have occurred since the early days of Islam, examples of which include the events of succession and Imams (PBUH) and they are the most prominent features of it. Unfortunately, nowadays, there are religious and sectarian conflicts in most of the Islamic countries including Pakistan, Afghanistan and Iraq. The issue of Imamate is a recurrent topic and some of the theologians have said in this regard "مأسل في الاسلام سيف كما" 2 "سل في الامامة"

No sword is raised in Islam like the one used on "Velayat and Imamate".

Accordingly, Martyr Mutahhari writes:

The issue of Imamate does not belong to the past, it is the issue of today's Islamic world and the issue of leadership of the Ummah, which was the cause of the survival and continuity of prophecy and the issue of Islamic destiny until the life of the Holy Prophet (peace be upon Him). However, leadership (Imamate and Caliphate) turned into a matter of disagreement among Muslims after the death of the prophet; although the conflict was over the Imam being an example to all, later the question of Imamate was raised as one of the most important theological topics. The Holy Qur'an also gives special significance to Imamate, and considers it as the last stage in the evolution of humankind that only the infallible prophets can perfect.

Therefore, it says:

«وَ إِذِ ابْتَلَىٰ إِبْرَاهِيمَ رَبُّهُ بِكَلِمَاتٍ فَأَتَمَّهُنَّ قَالَ إِنِّي جَاعِلُكَ لِلنَّاسِ إِمَامًا قَالَ وَمِنْ ذُرِّيَّتِي قَالَ لَا يَنَالُ عَهْدِي الظَّالِمِينَ»³

And when his Lord tried Ibrahim with certain words, he fulfilled them. He said: Surely I will make you an Imam of men. Ibrahim said: And of my offspring? My covenant does not include the unjust, said He

Certainly, both Shia and Sunni groups accept the concept of the Imam after the death of the Prophet (peace be upon him), but the subject of dispute between them is about their perception of Imamate. Shiite and Sunni scholars have been discussing Imamate and Caliphate in their interpretive and theological works. Of course, what seems to be important in this regard is that Muslim scholars have presented different approaches to discuss the issue (Imamate and Caliphate). One of the differences between Sunnis and Shiites in the discussion of Imamate and Caliphate is their approach. The Sunni scholars and theologians, in the discussion of Imamate and Caliphate, adopted the jurisprudential approach, which considered the issue of Imamate and Caliphate merely as a political theory and regarded it as one of the sub topics associated with Fiqh. They consider Imamate and Caliphate as a

² . Amini, 1982, p128.

³ .Al BAQARAH 124.

branch of “enjoining what is right and forbidding what is wrong” and they believe that since the implementation of this principle requires the presence of the Imam, the Ummah should choose an Imam for the administration of affairs in order to be able to apply this principle. However, Shiite theologians consider the theory of Imamate and Caliphate as the basis of religious doctrines and discuss it in theological works based on this viewpoint. Based on Shiite principles, Imamate and caliphate are one of the important principles of belief, Imamate and Caliphate complement each other and they are appointed by God Almighty, just as the prophet's position is a divine authority and Allah Almighty should determine His prophet and prophets.

The term Imam means ruler and leader and Imamate means leadership⁴. In other words, Imamate means general superintendence of the nation in all affairs of the world and religion as a successor of the Prophet (PBUH), the caliphate also means the succession, lawyer and vicegerent. Prophet Muhammad (PBUH & HP) is in charge of guidance and administration of the Islamic state⁵.

According to the Shia, the appointment of the Imamate and the caliphate of Imam Ali (peace be upon him) was performed by Allah Almighty and the issues of Imamate and the necessity of the existence of the Imam at all times, is based on the verses, narrations and historical references, and can be verified by adopting rational and narrative reasons. Imamate and caliphate in the Shia faith have three basic functions (political and social leadership, religious authority and internal Velayah) but according to Sunnis (religious authority and internal Velayah) do not exist and consider Imamate as political and social leadership chosen by a nation rather than God.⁶

According to the Shiite scholars and theologians valid verses and rituals are written in the Holy Qur'an and also by authentic narrators on the appointment of the Imamate and the caliphate of Imam Ali (as). There are many verses in the Holy Quran indicating the appointment of Imam Ali (AS) and other Imams. Of course, the relation of these verses is due to the great traditions of the Holy Prophet of Islam that have been revealed in relation to these verses. The most important Hadiths that are accepted by Shiite scholars and Sunni scholars are as follows:

يَا أَيُّهَا الرَّسُولُ بَلِّغْ مَا أُنْزِلَ إِلَيْكَ مِنْ رَبِّكَ وَإِنْ لَمْ تَفْعَلْ فَمَا بَلَّغْتَ رِسَالَتَهُ وَاللَّهُ يَعْصِمُكَ مِنَ النَّاسِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ لَا يَهْدِي الْقَوْمَ الْكَافِرِينَ

O Messenger, deliver what is sent down to you from your Lord; if you do not, you will not have conveyed His Message. Allah protects you from the people. Allah does not guide the nation, the unbelievers. (67)⁷

According to the Shiite scholars in this verse, the God Almighty in this verse has asked his prophet with a clear emphasis to announce his mission. A mission that completes the religion of Islam and the basis of the origin of God, and lack of following this divine command defects the mission. According to the traditions, the Holy Prophet (peace be upon Him), following the revelation of this verse in his famous saying: “So anyone I am his wali, Ali (a.)

⁴ Raqib Esfahani, 1992, p24

⁵ . Ibn Abi Al-Hatam, 1419, vol4 ,p135.

⁶ . Alousi, 1415 AH, p119.

⁷ AL-MAEDA (67)

is his wali chose him as his successor (THIS DOESN'T MAKE SENSE; WE HAVE THIS SAYING- 'Oh people, this is Ali (a.s) here is my successor, (wali) my caliph, and my vizier both in this world and the next')

(ALSO; 'This is my brother, mine executor and my successor amongst you. Harken unto him and obey him' (ibn Ishaq, Sirat Rasul Allah, tr.A Guilaume, The Life of Muhammas,118). chose him as his successor⁸. In addition, among other verses, the verse of obedience⁹ confirmed this as well.

In addition to the numerous sources of Shi'ism in Sunnite sources, it has also been narrated from the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) that he said that Ali (AS) is his successor and after him, my two children, Hassan and Hussein (AS) and nine other Imams as the children of Imam Hussein will come¹⁰.

Of course, this narrative is mentioned in addition to the narrations that have been made during the Hadith of Yum Eldar, Hadith of Mazilat, Hadith Ghadir Khum and the famous Hadith of Thaqalain or the hadiths that have been said twelve caliphs will come after me with whom the religion will achieve its virtue¹¹. Considering the above issues in this research, while examining the common and contradictory dimensions of Shiites and Sunnis on the appointment of Imamate and caliphate based on reason and quotation it is attempted to answer this question.

II. The theory of the appointment of Imamate and caliphate in the eyes of Shiites and Sunnis

Some Muslims who had seen the Prophet (PBUH & HP) believe that the Prophet of Islam (PBUH & HP), in order to preserve the religion of God for the time after him, appointed successors determined by God. In their view, successors to the Prophet (PBUH & HP) are 12 people, the first of whom was Ali ibn Abi Talib (PBUH), and the 12th is the Promised Imam Mahdi of the Apocalypse Imam. They have provided many rational and narrative documents on the appointment of Imamate and Caliphate for their claim and this group is called "Shiites". However, some Muslims believe that the Prophet did not appoint the Imam, successor or Wali and this is the responsibility of the Islamic community. Despite the strong rational and narrative reasons, they have no belief in the divine appointment of Imam and Caliphate and this group is called the Sunnis. Sunnis do not give the Imam a significant religious and ideological position, and they believe that proving it does not require rational arguments and it is considered as a minor jurisprudential issue.

Imamate and caliphate in Shiite beliefs are contrary to the Sunni beliefs. According to the , as the Prophet's position is a divine authority, Imamate is also a divine authority; and in the same way that it is never possible for anyone to reach prophesy through the election of people, no one will achieve the position of Imamate through the election of the people, rulers or a council. There is no difference between the Qur'anic caliphate and Imam and there is a rationale between the meaning of the Caliph and Imamate. However, the Sunni only considered Imam as the

⁸ . Tabataba'i,2012,p245.

⁹ . Tabrasi,2017,voll ,p159

¹⁰ . Imamate Research,2015,p141.

¹¹ . Tabrasi,2014AH.p289

Prophet's caliphate as only one political post, and this made Imamate a minor issue among jurisprudential issues with narrative rather than rational importance.

There are basic differences between Shiite and Sunni beliefs on the question of Imamate and caliphate. Although Shiites and Sunnis consider Imamate as necessary and inevitable, and to some extent, they have similar definitions of Imamate; there are fundamental differences in their viewpoints, which indicate their very different approaches to Imamate and Caliphate.

Proving the theory of divine appointment of Imamate and Caliphate from the point of view of reason and narrations

*** Philosophical and theological reasons for the necessity of the Imam**

1) Proof of grace: God Almighty began creation with love and has provided his servants with grace from the ultimate to eternity and His mercy reaches such a point that he sees is as obligatory towards His servants.

2) Proof of higher possibility: All the acts of God are created according to a purpose, and there is no vanity in the acts of God. Therefore, since the purpose of the creation of man is perfection (the human being that contains all the elements of creation and the existing being in the universe is for God), this perfect human being who is free from temporary passion is the Imam (PBUH), who is the mediator between the material world and the kingdom or super universe.

3) Proof of comprehensive manifestation: Since the creation of man is in the form of reason and lust, the appointment of messengers is to control his erotic dimension and help him to get rid of the temptations of the devil. Since the life of the Prophets is limited, the Imam is appointed to help him to get rid of the temptations of the devil along with the prophets' mission.

*** Quranic verses (narrative reasons)**

4) Iblaq verse: the essence of the verse indicates the divine appointment of the Imamate and because the verse is emphasized and obligatory and it warns the Prophet of Islam that if the task is not carried out completely, there will be a veil of ambiguity over his mission. In other words, the fulfillment of the mission of the Prophet (s) is part of the execution of this decree and this command is nothing but notification of the succession and Imamate of Imam Ali (AS).

5) The verse of perfection of religion and disappointment of the unbelievers: This verse also has an important message for all Muslims in the world as follows; Imamate and caliphate of Ali (as) are not coincidental and he has not become the successor randomly. Achieving this great position has a number of prerequisites including strong and rooted faith, saying one's prayers, maintaining the relationship between self and the creator, paying zakat and establishing a relationship between himself and other people has made Ali (AS) Amir al-Mu'minin.

6) Uli al-Amr verse: This verse is for reasons of the divine appointment of the Imamate and Caliphate of Imam Ali (as), which has placed obeying Imamate equal to obedience to Allah and the Prophet of Islam (peace be upon him and his family).

7) The verse of Mubahala: The verse of Mubahala is another narrative argument in the divine appointment of Imamate and Caliphate. This verse clearly indicates the supremacy and virtue of Ahlul Bayt. It can even be argued that this verse is revealed in the virtue of the Prophet's Ahlul Bayt. This is found in many interpretations among Shiite and Sunni commentators. An illustrative example of this is the words of Imam Reza (AS), which states: "God has revealed his good-natured servants in the verse of Mubahala and commands his Prophet to do Mubahala with the Christians." Following the revelation of this verse, the Prophet took Ali, and Fatimah and Hussein to Mubahala. It was an advantage that nobody has achieved other than Ahlul Bayt and is a virtue that no human has ever achieved and a noble honor, which no one has enjoyed before. Accordingly, some Sunni commentators after acknowledging the existence of the Ahlul Bayt along with the Prophet (peace be upon him and his family), have narrated many traditions about their virtues and that Allah has a special attachment to Ahlul Bayt of the Prophet (PBUH & HP). Mubahala verse indicates that after God and his Prophet, these are the masters and leaders of humanity and the manifested example of humankind. Therefore, He is interested in them and appointed them as Imam and Caliphate on earth who have the right to wilayat and imamate for each individual human being and this is the divine virtue achieved merely by them.

***Narrative reasons**

7) The Hadith of Position: The message of this hadith indicates the position and authority of Imam Ali (as), the Hadith considers the relation of Imam Ali (as) to the Prophet (PBUH) similar to relation of Aaron (peace be upon him) to Prophet Moses (Peace be upon him).

8) The Hadith of Thaqaalain: Prophet Muhammad (PBUH), in Hadith of Thaqaalain introduced the factor of prosperity and salvation of the Islamic Ummah as obeying the Holy Qur'an and Ahlul-Bayt (AS). Since the Quran introduces the guidance and prosperity of humans and it is infallible, Ahlul-Bayt, who have the same position as the Quran, must be immune from error and in other words, be innocent, and the infallibility is something sensual and inward.¹²

9) The Hadith of Ghadir: Prophet Muhammad (PBUH), this hadith explicitly states:

He said: "Who is your guide and leader? (mawlakum wa waliyyukum)" They said: "Your God, our guide, and you are our leader He said to him: I am pleased to announce you Imam and guide after me (min ba'di imam(an) wa hadiy(an)), So whomever I was his leader (mawla), then this is his leader (mawla).

¹² . Rabbani Golpayegani,1955,p326.

III. Conclusion

Based on this study, the religion of Islam is the most complete divine religion, which has all the commands and demands of God. The dynasty of great prophets was appointed to gradually transfer the demands of the creator based on the physical and mental capacities of man to show him the path of happiness and bring him to the source, which is the same as salvation and perfection. If the path of prosperity and perfection in the world is considered as a magnificent building, each of the prophets had missions in terms of man's capacity to build a part of that huge building. Therefore each of the prophets accepted a part of that building until the last prophet, the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him and his companions) came to complete the building of prosperity and perfection. Therefore, the Prophet is called the promised one and whatever is mentioned in the Scripture of Abraham (peace be upon him), Zabur the holy book of Dawud (AS), the Torah of Musa Kalim and the Gospel of Jesus (PBUH) were the preconditions for completing the religion of the Prophet (peace be upon him and his family), which was comprehensive and complete in the Holy Qur'an. This is why the religion of Islam is the most complete architecture for reaching the ultimate goal of creation and achieving perfection. However, God's demands have degrees. In the last years of His life, with His Lord's blessing the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) receives the decree to strengthen the foundations of the new Islam. According to the clear verse of the Holy Quran, any retardation in doing so will disrupt the entire mission of the Prophet (peace be upon him and his family) of Islam. Therefore, the Prophet of Islam performed this important mission on the day of Ghadir Khum introducing Imam Ali (as) as his successor and Imam. However, after the death of the Prophet, some Muslims cause certain events that result in the greatest challenge of the Islamic community and somehow prevent the divine command, and divide the Islamic community into two parties. Some Muslims who have seen the Prophet (PBUH & HP) believe that the Prophet of Islam (PBUH & HP), in order to preserve the religion of God for the time after him, will appoint successors determined by God. In their view, successors to the Prophet (PBUH & HP) are 12 people, the first of whom is Ali ibn Abi Talib (PBUH), and the 12th is the Promised Imam Mahdi of the Apocalypse Imam. They have provided many rational and narrative documents on the appointment of Imamate and Caliphate for their claim and this group is called "Shiites". However, Muslims believe that the Prophet did not appoint an Imam, successor or Wali and this is the responsibility of the Islamic community. Despite the strong rational and narrative reasons, they have no belief in the divine appointment of Imam and Caliphate and this group is called the 'Sunnis'.

Sunnis do not use a coherent method in the field of Imamate and Caliphate and their beliefs in this regard are contradictory. They do not even perform what they say they will and easily disengage from their beliefs and stand against them. Some of them, on the one hand, consider it as general and comprehensive superintendence in the world affairs but others say, "Imamate does not enjoy a significant religious and ideological position and does not require rational arguments but is considered as minor jurisprudential issues. It seems that this group has encountered problems in the face of rational arguments are more biased as seen in their ignorant statements. Some of them do consider justice, science, ijtiḥad and intuition of Imams and Caliphate of Muslims. However, they say, "if an ignorant wrongdoer becomes a caliph and prevents Hudud by his actions contrary to Islam and the Qur'an and causes oppression against Muslims as well as the violation of their rights, he will not become disqualified from

caliphate. Others also discuss determining a successor by the previous caliph or through a council. Another group says even if one occupies the position of Caliph by force of arms and military, he will be the obligatory caliph of the Muslims, which is the confirmation of a kind of system of tyranny and one of the demands of the Prophet (PBUH) was to fight these types of government systems in the world of humanity. However, they do not consider the Imams and the Caliph as divine appointments and believe that Imamate and leadership are not the principles of religion, but they are considered as a subcategory of the teachings of religion. Despite the strong rational and narrative reasons, they have no belief in the divine appointment of Imam and Caliphate, they believe that the Prophet (peace be upon him) did not choose anyone for his succession, and after the death of the Prophet, that it was the responsibility of the people.¹³

Contrary to Sunni belief, Imamate and caliphate in Shia beliefs is a vital issue in the Islamic world. According to Shia, as the Prophet's position is a divine authority, Imamate is also a divine authority; and in the same way that it is never possible for anyone to reach prophesy through the election of the people, no one will achieve the position of Imam through the election of the people, rulers or a council. Therefore, according to Shi'ism, the philosophy of the Prophets' existence is the same as that of Imams'. Imamate in the Shia viewpoint is a position granted by God to a certain person with attributes of the highest qualities and degrees of perfection (such as infallibility and insight). Therefore, it is not an official or selective choice resulting from the existence of certain qualifications for someone to choose as an Imam for the Muslims. It must be noted, the issue of Imamate is the only basic principle that distinguishes Shia from other Islamic sects. The Shiites, unlike Sunni, refer to the issue of Imamate as a fundamental part of religion and consider it as one pillar of the principles of religion. According to Shia Muslims, Imamate is a divine position that is appointed by God according to His knowledge about the conditions and needs of His servants, as with the Prophet, and while requiring the Prophet to guide the Ummah to an Imam, He obliges the people to follow him. Shias see Imamate as divine prophecy. From the Shiite point of view, there is no difference between the Qur'anic caliph and Imam. Shias believe, "the meaning of a divine Caliph is to emphasize that as the prophecy is from Allah, the position of Imamate is also divine. The Shias, through this analysis, prove the legitimacy of the Imam as the "successor of the Prophet". Contrary to the Sunnis, who introduce the divine caliph, are seeking to justify the choices of the Imam by agreement, the Shiite scholars, by giving the title of Khalifa Allah to an Imam is seeking to express the divine aspect of the Imamate's position in order to separate it from the purely chosen and political aspect of the Sunni beliefs. The Imam and the caliph of the Sunnis only coordinate with the Khalifa of Allah in the field of implementation (which is one of the works of the Khalifah of Allah), since in the Sunni view he is the one with political expert and capable of executing Hudud and is sufficient to prove Imamate. They consider the Imam as the Caliphate of Al-Rasul, and the Caliph of prophet is only a political position, which makes imam as a sub issue among the jurisprudential issues and its necessity is narrative rather than rational.

Regarding what has been discussed so far, there are differences between the Shiites and Sunnis on the question of Imamate and caliphate. Although Shiites and Sunnis consider Imamate as necessary and inevitable, and

¹³ . Amidi, 1999, p342.

to some extent, they have similar definitions of Imamate; there are fundamental differences in their viewpoints, which indicate their very different approaches to Imamate and Caliphate. According to both of them after the demise of the Prophet, a revelation (other than the inspiration) was cut off forever, and no one could assume such a position.¹⁴

Imamate has three main functions among Shia Muslims: a) Political and social leadership; b) Religious authority; c) and internal Velaya; but according to Sunnis (religious authority and internal Velayah) do not exist and consider Imamate as political and social leadership and they reduce the dignity of the Imamate as a subordinate subject controlling the conduct of the Muslims. However, in view of the Shias, Imamate is a theological issue that refers to a divine act and God's relationship with humankind. According to the Shias viewpoint, the Imam must be infallible and have knowledge of all truths, teachings and ordinances of the Shari'ah and be the best of people in all human virtues, especially those that are in the direction of the goals and objectives of Imamate and Leadership.

God Almighty began creation with love and has provided his servants with grace from the ultimate to eternity and His mercy reaches such a point that he sees it as obligatory towards His servants. God blessed causes for saving man from sin and temporary passion, one of which was to send prophets to guide humankind in theoretical and practical dimensions in their worldly life to salvation and perfection, the protection of God's demand following the mission of the Prophet (peace be upon him and his family). However, the other reason proving the ultimate goal is that all the acts of God are created according to a purpose, and there is no vanity in the acts of God. Therefore, since the purpose of the creation of man is perfection (the human being that contains all the elements of creation and the existing being in the universe is for God), the perfect human being who is free from temporary passion is the Imam (PBUH), who is the mediator between the material world and the kingdom or super universe. Therefore, it is the main principle and other things are minor issues.

References

1. The Holy Quran
2. Alousi, Seyyed Mahmoodrouh Al-Me'ani, in the interpretation of Al-Qa'r Al-Azim, Beirut, Dar al-Kabul Al-Ummah, 1415 AH.
3. Amidi, Abdul Wahid, Gharar al-Hakam, and Rural Kallam, translated by Seyyed Hashem Rasouli Mahallati, Tehran, Publishing House of Islamic Culture, first edition, 1999.
4. Ahmad Bin Hanbal, Masandahambhane Hanbal, (Sha'yb Al-Nuroun). Beirut, Alresaleh Institute, 1917.
5. Amini, Abdolhossein, Al-Ghadirifi Maktab valsinah, Valdeb, Jalalul, Tehran, Dar al-Kabul al-Islamiyah, 1982
6. Ibn Abi Al-Hatam, Abdurrahman ibn Muhammad, Al-Quran al-Aqim, Vol 4, Saudi Arabia, Maktabe Nizar al-Mustafa al-Baz, Volume Four, Third Edition, 1419 AH.

¹⁴ . Mehrin Shoshtari,1977,p411.

7. Imamate Research, Yazdi Motlagh (Fazil), Mahmoud, Review of Imamieh, Mu'tazila, and Sharah's views on the efforts of a group of writers. Mashad: Razavi Islamic University of Science, Fourth Edition, 2015.
8. Imam Ali (as), Nahj al-Balaghah, translated by Muhammad Dashti, Qom, Mosque Jamdqaddas Jamkaran Publications, 2000.
9. Mehrin Shoshtari, Abbas, The Dictionary of Quranic terms, Tehran, Mariya Publication, First Edition, 1977.
10. Ragheb Esfahani, Hussein ibn Muhammad, Mofradat al-Faqah al-Quran, researcher Safwan Adnan Davoodi, Lebanon and Syria, Dar al-'Alm al-Ladar Shamieh, 1992.
11. Rabbani Golpayegani, Ali, Imamate in Islam, Qom, Bostan Book, 2011.
12. Rabbani Golpayegani, Ali, Comparative Speech, Prophecy, Imamate and Mead, Qom, Office of Programming and Texting, 1955.
13. Seyvati, Mohid al-Din, Al-Khulfaa history, Tehran, Huraa publishing house, first edition, 1404.
14. Tabataba'i, Mohammad Hossein, Nahyat al-Hikameh, Qom, Qom Seminary Teachers Society, Sixth Edition, 2012 .
15. Tabrasi, Ahmad bin Ali, Allah Tajaj, Volume 1 & 2, Research by Mohammad Bagher Mousavi Khorasani, Najaf Ashraf, Second Edition, 2007.
16. Tabrasi, Abu Mansoor Ahmad ibn Ali, Al-Ehohadjj, Volume 1, Mashhad, Morteza Publishing, First Printing, 1400 AH.