

Muslim Teachers' Characteristics Based on Integrated Holistic Education System

¹Sapie Sabilan, *¹Mohd Isa Hamzah, ¹Ab. Halim Tamuri and ²Suhana Mohamed Lip

Abstract--- This article aims to explore Muslim teachers' characteristics based on Integrated Holistic Education System (IHES), which is applied in the education system under Selangor State Religious Department (JAIS). IHES under JAIS education system aims to give thorough education, nurture good akhlaq among students and produce Al Quran generation equipped with knowledge and taqwa. The exploration of Muslim teachers' characteristics and roles is based on studies related to the evaluation on JAIS IHES education process from the aspects of ta'lim, ta'dib, tadrib, taujih and irsyad. In this research, a total of 122 JAIS Islamic education teachers from Hulu Langat and Sepang districts were selected as respondents for the pilot study. The reliability and validity of the instrument used had been tested by using Item Content Validity Index (I-CVI), which involved ten experts. I-CVI was used to determine the level of reliability among the selected experts. The result of the average score of Item Content Validity Index (S-CVI) showed a high value for the construct of IHES education process with 0.941. While the value of Cronbach Alpha showed a high value of consistency with the value of 0.92 and can be considered as in acceptable range. Based on I-CVI and Cronbach Alpha evaluation, it can be concluded that the items constructed can be accepted as representation of sub construct for IHES education process namely ta'lim, ta'dib, taujih and irsyad. The findings from the research also explained on the roles of SRA JAIS teachers as mu'allim, muaddib, mudarrib, muwajjih dan mursyid..

Keywords--- Muslim Teachers' Characteristics, Islamic Education, IHES.

I. INTRODUCTION

The goal of education in Malaysia is to develop the racial element and country towards a united society in the aspects of social, culture, politics and economy. The final achievement of this aim is to produce a harmonious, disciplined, responsible and skilled community in our society. Teachers' involvement in the education system is as foundations and implementers of the government policies on curriculum and circulations. The success of education system should be viewed positively without excluding the supports from teachers and other support system. Hence, the assurance of a country's excellence is determined by the development of its education field and teachers' training institutions. In this context, teachers' task as curriculum implementers should include the responsibility to achieve a standard level, and the quality of education system. The goals of education can only be realised through the delivery of knowledge, skills, experience, values, attitude and *sahsiah* continuously from one generation to another. Teachers' responsibility is to educate and guide society, in which this effort has undeniably assisted the development of our society and country particularly in moulding students' attitude and *sahsiah*. This research focused on *muslim* teachers'



characteristics through the terms of *ta'lim*, *ta'dib*, *tadrib*, *taujih* and *irsyad* in teachers' teaching context in schools based on IHES education process. Therefore, the exploration of this focus would include the views and considerations from academic scholars and experts from Islamic education field.

II. BACKGROUND

Islamic education in Selangor has expanded since 1898, with the establishment of Women Religious School or Sekolah Agama Perempuan in Kuala Langat district. This development had expanded to other districts with the orientation on pondok school system and *madrasah* until 1977. After the year 1977, the religious education curriculum has been integrated with the national curriculum. Through this education system, it is apparent that the element of knowledge integration has started informally from the early establishment of JAIS education system with the combination of *naqli* and *aqli* knowledge in the effort of upgrading Islamic education in Selangor. Currently, Islamic Education Division (BPI) JAIS is responsible in managing Islamic education system in Selangor. The objective of BPI JAIS is to empower management system and education services as well as to upgrade the quality of curriculum comprehensively to produce pious *insan*.

The Islamic education system used by JAIS currently is known as IHES. IHES is an innovation on JAIS existing Islamic education system to give better impacts on students' outcome in primary and secondary level. This system started in 2007 with the establishment of MITIB (Maahad Integrasi Tahfiz Sains dan Teknologi Istana Bandar), which was approved by the Islamic Religious Council (MAIS) and the Selangor state government. This system is also related to a research by Universiti Perguruan Sultan Idris (UPSI) in 2006 on knowledge integration issues towards JAIS Curriculum Division. The approval on policy paper and JAIS Islamic Education direction proposal by MAIS Education Committee has made IHES as an educational practice under BPI, JAIS and has been documented in JAIS 2014 Strategic Plan and JAIS 2015 to 2019 Strategic Plan (Bahagian Pendidikan Islam JAIS, 2015). IHES was launched officially on 7th March 2015 by the Selangor Chief Minister.

IHES concept is an education system which integrates all units and elements of education in school thoroughly. This system is being practised in all Primary Religious Schools (SRA), Primary Integration Religious Schools (SRAI) and Maahad Integrasi Tahfiz Sains (MITS) in Selangor, as an important added value to the existing national education system. The goals of system implementation is to realise the objectives: (a) to purify *aqidah* (*iman*) (b) to upgrade sincerity and *ibadah* (*ihsan*), (c) to complete *akhlaq* (Islam) and (d) to prepare for the doomsday (Kamarulnizam & Zetty Nurzuliana, 2018). The objective of this system is to purify *aqidah*, so that humans will be aware of the existence of one God that is Allah S.W.T through the field of knowledge. The source of knowledge requires two *dalil* through *naqli* from al-Quran and al-Sunnah. While, the second proof is through *aqli* or researches in appreciating Allah SWT creations. These two *dalil naqli* and *aqli* are crucial and complementing each other as to mould students to think holistically and not depended on the mind ability only. While IHES implementation involves six main components: (i) Education characteristics (ii) Education development level (iii) Education process (iv) Approaches (v) Monitoring and (vi) Assessment & Evaluation. In this research, only one component is chosen as the

²Faculty of Education, Selangor International Islamic University College, Malaysia.

¹Faculty of Education, National University of Malaysia.



main focus, which involves IHES education process, with the aim to explore *Muslim* teachers' characteristics through *ta'lim*, *ta'dib*, *tadrib*, *taujih* and *irsyad terms* (Bahagian Arkib JAIS, 2019).

III. PROBLEM STATEMENT

Teachers' roles and responsibility in and outside of the classroom have been discussed widely. The first debate was augmented in the world Conference of Islamic Education (1977) in Makkah, in which a resolution had been made for teachers to take the roles of *murabbi*, *mu* 'allim and *muaddib*. These terms came from the needs in the field of Islamic education which in line with the integration of the implementation of education process in terms of *tarbiyyah*, *ta'lim* and *ta'dib* (Muhammad Zainal, 2018). In general, the term *tarbiyyah* refers to the process of educating, *ta'lim* is a process of delivering knowledge and *ta'dib* is a process of educating *adab*. Based on a research done by Kamarul Azmi and Ab. Halim, (2010), teachers' roles consist of the roles as *mudarris*, *mu'allim*, *murabbi*, *mu'addib* and *mursyid*. Every role of teachers has its own specified categories.

The findings from Ab. Halim Tamuri & Siti Muhibah Nor, (2015), started that teaching practice among Islamic education teachers as *muaddib* was the most dominant, followed by the role as *murabbi*. While, the teachers' quality through the domains of *mursyid*, *mu'allim* and *mudarris* should be increased in the Islamic education teaching and learning process. This research showed *mudarris* domain as the lowest among the other domains, although it is deemed as the most important in creating conducive classroom environment, selection of effective methods, and suitable strategies for students. According to Razila et al. (2019), teachers' responsibility is not only to teach and deliver knowledge in schools, but is wider as caliphs of Allah S.W.T to prosper nature and the world through education.

In this context, JAIS BPI has used IHES elements as the foundation to the Islamic education system in Selangor. Teachers' roles as *mu* 'allim, *muaddib*, *mudarrib*, *muwajjih* and *mursyid* have also being practiced in the system (Bahagian Pendidikan Islam JAIS, 2015). Previous research findings had suggested many definitions and elaborations on the roles of Muslim teachers. However, Muslim teachers' characteristics in IHES education process have not been discussed thoroughly. Therefore, this research should identify specific characteristics to elaborate each teachers' role as *mu* 'allim, *muaddib*, *mudarrib*, *muwajjih* and *mursyid* in JAIS IHES model.

IV. TEACHERS' CONCEPT AND PROFESSIONALISM

Generally, teachers are defined as those who teach, nurture and guide. A teacher is an individual who becomes a reference to others and a nurturer is a person who care, foster and educate. While, an educator is a person who foster and train. Teachers' concept in Islam can be explained through many terms like *murabbi*, *mu'allim* and *muaddib*. A few definitions on Islamic education teachers (GPI) see teachers as teaching staff (*mu'allim*), guide (*muaddib*), trainer (*mudarrib*), advisor (*muwajjih*) and consultant (*mursyid*) (Hasni, 2019).

A teacher is a person who has exceptional personality, efficient with variety of teaching and learning skills, the ability to create good classroom ambience and environment as well as good expertise, efficiency and ability in deciding professionally and the responsibility to plan and provide teaching and learning. A teacher is a person who teaches by giving guideline, advice, good example, a way to avoid misguidance, assistance in differentiating the good



and the bad, training, guidance, nurturing talent, improving potential and art. A teacher is also inculcating, purifying, encouraging and preserving students' *fitrah* with spiritual education, *akhlaq*, *sahsiah*, *adab*, culture and good societal values. Moreover, a teacher also educates, nurtures, fosters, develops, and gives love in the physical development and progression framework of students in the aspects of physical, emotional, spiritual, intellectual and social (JERIS) as to produce a pious *insan* (Kamarul Azmi, 2017).

In teaching field, professionalism is closely related to the quality in working practice, morality and ethics. Professional working practice consists of professional behaviours in terms of being obedient to ethical needs, doing reflections on teaching tasks and being motivated to learn and progress. It is also related to active involvement in upgrading teachers' professionalism by the effort of implementing educational reform, certification, teachers' acknowledgement, administration as well as the handling of professional matters for example in decision making for working requirements in the education field (Habibah @ Artini et al., 2016).

Professional development exists in most organizations to ensure the quality improvement among staff. Therefore, professional development among teachers is deemed important. Teachers' professional development is implemented as the main mechanism to bring change in the education field, to enhance work performance, to add experience, to structure professional knowledge, to upgrade teachers' education and to prepare teachers for change and challenges in the world of education. Moreover, teachers should be able to fulfill demands in enhancing individual professional level through the development of knowledge and new skills.

V. PURPOSE OF RESEARCH

This research aims to elaborate the characteristics of IHES teaching process through *ta'lim*, *ta'dib*, *tadrib*, *taujih* and *irsyad* terms as well as to determine validity and reliability of the research instrument by using Item Content Validity Index (I-CVI) the *Alpha Cronbach* value. The construct is related to JAIS IHES education process construct being practiced by JAIS SRA teachers.

VI. METHODOLOGY

This quantitative research applied a survey method by using a set of questionnaire as the instrument to collect data from the respondents. SPSS version 22.0 was used to analyse quantitative data obtained descriptively and inferentially. The research implemented was a pilot study, which involved 122 Islamic education teachers from SRA JAIS as the research respondents. The schools selected were from the Hulu Langat and Sepang districts. The research instrument was divided into eight main divisions, which among them was C division which referred to IHES education process with 5 subconstructs and 29 items. Five levels Likert scale was used for the questionnaire. The scale evaluation consisted of scale 1 representing strongly disagree value (0 - 19%), scale 2 representing disagree value (20 - 39%), scale 3 representing moderately agree value (40 - 59%), scale 4 representing agree value (60 - 79%) and scale 5 representing strongly agree value (80 - 100%) (Mohd Azmi, 2016). The data analysis would be utilizing the Alpha Cronbach test and facial validity and item content validity index (I-CVI) to obtain validity and reliability results (Gay et al., 2011; Ramlan, 2017)

²Faculty of Education, Selangor International Islamic University College, Malaysia.

¹Faculty of Education, National University of Malaysia.



VII. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1) Validity and Reliability of Research Instrument

The implemented pilot test involved 122 teachers from SRA and SRAI JAIS. The alpha value for validity and reliability of the questionnaire items was very high with 0.92 for 29 items for JAIS IHES education process constructs as in Table 1. This value can be considered as high based on the views from Pallant (2010), in which he stated that the alpha value should reach more than 0.7. Therefore, the items in the questionnaire for the construct can be considered as reliable with high consistency value to be used in the study.

| Tuble 1. Remainly Value for White Hills Education Process | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---------------------------------|------|----------------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| No. | Construct | Item | Alpha Cronbach Value | | | | | | |
| 1. | Ta'lim (teaching & learning) | 6 | | | | | | | |
| 2. | Ta'dib (coaching & learning) | 6 | | | | | | | |
| 3. | Tadrib (training & learning) | 6 | 0.92 | | | | | | |
| 4. | Taujih (advisory & learning) | 5 | | | | | | | |
| 5. | Irsyad (consultancy & learning) | 6 | | | | | | | |

Table 1: Reliability Value for JAIS IHES Education Process

2) Face Validity and Content

The findings in Table 2 shows a very high value for face validity and content through I-CVI and S-CVI evaluation. The I-CVI value for JAIS IHES education process construct was between 0.80 -1.00 and the S-CVI value reached 0.941 which involving assessment from 10 experts. This value was agreed by Davis (1992) and Polit et al. (2007) in which the accepted value for I-CVI is \geq 0.80. Based on these data, the agreed value from experts for each item was very high and can be used in the actual research. Therefore, at this level, all items in the questionnaire can be utilised.

| | Experts | | | | | | | | I-CVI | | |
|-----|---------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|-------|----|------|
| | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | |
| CI | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| C2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| C3 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| C4 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| C5 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| C6 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| C7 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0.80 |
| C8 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| C9 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| CI0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| CI1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| CI2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| CI3 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| CI4 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| CI5 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| CI6 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| CI7 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| CI8 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0.80 |
| CI9 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |

Table 2: Score for Each Item to Evaluate I-CVI and S-CVI for JAIS IHES Education Process Construct



ISSN:1475-7192

| C20 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
|------------------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|-------|
| C21 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| C22 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| C23 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| C24 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| C25 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| C26 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| C27 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| C28 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0.90 |
| C29 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1.00 |
| Average Score | 0.79 | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 | 0.86 | 0.75 | 1.00 | 1.00 | |
| | | | | | | | | | S-C | CVI | 0.941 |

3) Muslim Teachers' Characteristics Based on IHES Education Process

Education is a continuous and consistent process. Hence, teachers' roles are crucial in achieving the aims and objectives of the country education. In evaluating teachers' roles and tasks in teaching and learning, 5M model on *mu'allim, muaddib, mudarrib, muwajjih* and *mursyid* (Bahagian Pendidikan Islam JAIS, 2015) was utilised. This model gives a thorough picture of teachers' roles and responsibility in schools. *Mu'allim* refers to teachers' role in the classroom to inform, teach, transfer and deliver all sorts of information, discipline and knowledge to students through lectures, exercises, oral, drills, instruction or any type of planned teaching (Kamarul Azmi & Ab. Halim, 2010). Teachers' teaching process as *mu'allim* is called as *ta'lim*, which refers to a condition where teachers should possess, master and cultivate knowledge. Teachers as *mu'allim* must also master syllabus clearly and must be equipped with issues and contemporary information. Furthermore, a teacher should apply the knowledge being taught and elaborate ideas effectively to students.

The education process through the term *ta'dib* is a process of educating a person, who has the ability to develop own potential towards self-development, attitude and *sahsiah* suitable with the framework specified by Allah S.W.T. In this context, the term *mu'addib* refers to teachers' role to nurture, educate, mould, guide, inculcate, purify, encourage good *akhlaq*, discipline, behaviour, *sahsiah* and good *adab* in the development of self among students (Kamarul Azmi & Ab. Halim, 2010). Therefore, the role of teachers as *mu'addib* in the education process should inculcate good *akhlaq* in teaching and stress on students' *adab*, self-worth and good personality. Moreover, teachers should always correct students' errors and show friendliness and love towards students.

Tadrib or training is defined as a planned learning process with the purpose to enhance students' ability in problem solving, to develop students' skills and to encourage students to become more competitive in the future as to upgrade competency, productivity, honesty and sincerity in the profession (Noornajihan & Zetty Nurzuliana, 2015). A teacher who is a *mudarrib* should understand the goal of an education program and possess knowledge as well as skills needed in the training. Tadrib process involves teachers implementing teaching and learning activities in levels. These levels refer to easy to hard, low to advance activity and focus more on weak students. Other *mudarrib* characteristics are always show modesty or *tawadu'*, give motivation to students to excel and assess students' intelligence by giving tasks.

¹Faculty of Education, National University of Malaysia.

²Faculty of Education, Selangor International Islamic University College, Malaysia.



Four conditions as *mudarrib* can affect the effectiveness of training: clarity, variability, task orientation and involvement in the learning process. (i) Clarity refers to ways teachers present materials to students. Teachers should have high clarity level in elaborating to students by allocating time in delivering information. (ii) Variability refers to trainers' flexibility in presenting materials to students. Effective trainers would try to create variability by using variety of materials, methods and questions to ensure students' focus during the training session. (iii) Task orientation is referring to teachers' action which is based on performance, for example teachers would ensure students' comprehension is always high during training session. Teachers as an effective *mudarrib* would use strategy, technique, teaching materials and time effectively. (iv) Learning environment means the members in the organisation believe that learning or training has its own important role in students' tasks. Teachers' effective involvement in the learning process is by ensuring the smoothness of the learning process.

Teachers as *muwajjih* refers to teachers' role as advisors to students. As advisors, teachers' role in school is more important since teachers should guide students to become humans with good morality or *adab*, good personality, good manners, and good *akhlaq*. Without the guide from teachers, students would face difficulties with their own development. As the students grow, their dependency on teachers would also decrease. This education process is called as *taujih*. The characteristics of *muwajjih* teachers are to have good *sahsiah*, polite in giving advice to students, use suitable discourse to aid comprehension, give clear instruction on any tasks, possess patience and fairness, show leadership with *hikmah* and alert to students' issues. Most students always face the needs to make decision for themselves, therefore, they tend to rely on teachers' advice more to assist them (Nazirah Hamdan & Kamarul Azmi Jasmi, 2016).

Mursyid refers to the teachers' leadership quality in the classroom to foster, advice, instruct, guide and show students the way to develop self in terms of JERI to become *soleh insan*. This education process refers to teachers' role as *mursyid*, which is *irsyad* that is a teacher who can encourage students' leadership quality, stimulate students' thinking and guide students in problem solving. A teacher should also be able to do consultation by combining training method with other teaching methods to encourage self-access learning. A mursyid teacher should also have tolerance, fairness and alertness towards students and good *mushawarah* characteristics (Kamarul Azmi & Ab. Halim, 2010; Noornajihan & Zetty Nurzuliana, 2015).

VIII. CONCLUSION

In conclusion, based on the Alpha Cronbach value and I-CVI for JAIS IHES education process constructs showed that the items developed can be considered as suitable and acceptable. The Alpha Cronbach value showed the validity and reliability level of the questionnaire items as very high at 0.92. While, the I-CVI test showed a high agreement among the selected experts for JAIS IHES education process constructs with the value achieved between 0.80 -1.00 and S-CVI value at 0.941. Therefore, the items developed in the sub constructs of JAIS IHES teaching process can be used in the actual research. The findings also exposed *Muslim* teachers' characteristics through the terms *ta'lim*, *ta'dib*, *tadrib*, *taujih* and *irsyad* based on JAIS IHES education process. Based on the discussion of findings, JAIS SRA teachers' roles can also be defined through the terms *mu'allim*, *muaddib*, *mudarrib*, *muwajjih* and *mursyid*.



ISSN:1475-7192

REFERENCES

- 1. Ab. Halim, T., & Siti Muhibah, N. (2015). Prinsip pembelajaran aktif dalam pengajaran dan pembelajaran pendidikan Islam. Jurnal Pendidikan Fakulti Pendidikan, 2(3), 28–42.
- 2. Bahagian Arkib Jabatan Agama Islam Selangor (JAIS). (2019). Senarai Penyelidikan JAIS. Selangor.
- 3. Bahagian Pendidikan Islam JAIS. (2015). Komponen Pelaksanaan IHES. JAIS, Selangor.
- 4. Davis, L. L. (1992). Instrument review: Getting the most from your panel of experts. Applied Nursing Research, 5, 194–197.
- 5. Gay, L. R., Mills, G. E., & Airasian, P. W. (2011). Educational Research: Competencies for Analysis and Applications. New Jersey: Pearson.
- Habibah @ Artini, R., Zaharah, H., Saedah, S., Mohd Ridhuan, M. J., Ahmad Arifin, S., & Norshahrul Marzuki, M. N. (2016). Keperluan profesionalisme guru pendidikan Islam (GPI). E-Jurnal Penyelidikan dan Inovasi, 3(3), 85–109.
- Hasni, M. (2019). IHES: Its Application in Life and Industrial Revolution 4.0. https://pendidikan.jais.gov.my/sites/default/files/Merealisasikan%20Kemenjadian%20Murid%20Melalui%20Sis tem%20Pendidikan%20Yang%20Holistik.pdf.
- 8. Kamarul Azmi, J. (2010). Guru Cemerlang Pendidikan Islam Sekolah Menengah di Malaysia: Satu Kajian Kes. Phd thesis, Selangor: Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia.
- 9. Kamarul Azmi, J. (2017). Guru Cemerlang di Malaysia. In Ensiklopedia Pendidikan Islam. Jasmi, Kamarul Azmi (ed.), Johor: Fakulti Tamadun Islam dan Persatuan Cendekiawan Pendidikan Islam. pp. 56-59.
- 10. Kamarul Azmi, J., & Ab. Halim, T. (2010). Pendidikan Islam: Kaedah Pengajaran & Pembelajaran. Johor: Universiti Teknologi Malaysia.
- Kamarulnizam, S., & Zetty Nurzuliana, R. (2018). Penilaian terhadap sistem pendidikan integrasi dan holistik di sekolah rendah agama integrasi Jabatan Agama Islam negeri Selangor. Malaysian Online Journal of Education, 2(2), 1–6.
- 12. Mohd Azmi, M. Y. (2016). Penilaian Program Latihan dalam Perkhidmatan Pentaksiran Berasaskan Sekolah (PBS). Phd thesis, Selangor: Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia.
- 13. Muhammad Zainal, A. (2018). Islamic education based on quantum learning: Conceptual and methodological perspective. Madania: Jurnal Kajian Keislaman, 22(2), 159-172.
- 14. Nazirah, H., & Kamarul Azmi, J. (2016). Sifat keperibadian guru pendidikan Islam (GPI) terhadap rakan setugas dan pihak atasan di sekolah: Satu kajian kes. UMRAN International Journal of Islamic and Civilizational Studies, 3(2), 85–91.
- 15. Noornajihan, J., & Zetty Nurzuliana, R. (2015). Model kualiti guru pendidikan Islam sebagai murabbi menurut sarjana Islam. Tinta Artikulasi Membina Ummah, 1(1), 101–108.
- 16. Pallant, J. (2010). SPSS Survival Manual: A Step by Step Guide to Data Analysis Using SPSS. England: Open University Press/McGraw-Hill.
- 17. Polit, D. F., Beck, C. T., & Owen, S. V. (2007). Focus on research methods is the CVI an acceptable indicator of content validity? appraisal and recommendations. Research in Nursing & Health, 30, 459–467.
- 18. Ramlan, M. (2017). Rekabentuk Model Integriti Akademik Berasaskan Penghayatan Rohani. Phd thesis, Kuala Lumpur: Universiti Malaya.
- Razila, K., Mohd Faiz, B., Noraizan, M., Norliza, K., & Mashita, A. H. (2019). Amalan kualiti guru dalam kalangan guru pendidikan Islam di sekolah kebanggsaan. Journal of Management and Operation Research, 1(4), 1–23.

²Faculty of Education, Selangor International Islamic University College, Malaysia.

¹Faculty of Education, National University of Malaysia.