# Citizenship-Behaviour and Workplace-Withdrawal: Distinguishing Between the Organization and Job-Based Turnover Intentions in Nurses

<sup>1</sup>Syed Imad Shah, <sup>2</sup>Asad Shahjehan, <sup>3</sup>Muhammad Daud Ali, <sup>4</sup>Humera Manzoor

Abstract--This study investigated the relationship of nurses' organizational citizenship behaviour with their organization-based and job-based turnover intentions. As no prior research has explored the relationship of nurses' organizational citizenship behaviour with intentions to leave the organizations and current job as separate behavioural outcomes, therefore, this research serves to fill an important research gap. This study is carried on the faculty members of nursing education institutes in Pakistan. 124 full-time and part-time faculty members participated in the survey. Among the four dimensions of OCB sportsmanship, civic virtue, and helping were found to be highly significant predictors of organization-based and job-based turnover intentions. Interestingly the relationship between Altruism and organization-based turnover intentions was found to be insignificant. This study improves our understanding about the relationship between nurses' organizational citizenship behaviour and organization and job-based turnover intentions. It makes a contribution to the extant literature as it adds empirical findings to the existing body of knowledge. Furthermore, this study provides us with exciting practical implication especially in the area of employee retention in general and nurse retention in specific. The results of this study can help managers to understand turnover intentions and its OCB precursors.

**Key words--**Organizational citizenship behaviour, organization based turnover intentions, Job-based turnover intentions

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Organizational citizenship behaviour (OCB) at nursing workplace has been under substantial focus in research during the last decade and scholars have placed significant efforts in examining the determinants of OCB conceptually and empirically (Chang, 2014; Chu, Lee, Hsu, & Chen, 2005; Yoo, Yoo, & Kim, 2012). Podsakoff, MacKenzie, Paine, and Bachrach (2000) have reported the outcomes of OCB as improved service, reduced clients, peers and supervisor complaints, improved performance and organizational efficiency. Organ (1988) presented one of the pioneering and comprehensive definitions of OCB as an 'Individual behaviour that is discretionary, not directly or explicitly recognized by the formal reward system and that in aggregate promotes the effective functioning of the organization' (p. 4). Organ also characterized discretionary behaviours to be non-enforceable by job descriptions, as a matter of personal choice and failing to display these behaviours is non-punishable.

For nurses' workplace citizenship is based on discretionary efforts that exceed their job descriptions. These discretionary efforts are targeted either towards the organization or towards its members and clients

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Institute of Management Studies, University of Peshawar, Peshawar, Pakistan, imad\_shah@hotmail.com

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Department of Management Sciences, Hazara University, Mansehra, Pakistan, asadshahjehan@hotmail.com

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Department of Management Sciences, University of Haripur, Haripur, Pakistan, dr.daud@uoh.edu.pk

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Institute of Management Sciences, Kohat University of Science and Technology, Kohat, Pakistan, humera@kust.edu.pk

ISSN: 1475-7192

making individuals as the primary target. In the case of nurses, citizenship is immersed under the umbrella of helping, based on different forms of behaviours resulting in social, moral and practical assistance. Altruism, courtesy, and conciliation are identified as significant traits of helping behaviour (Lv, Shen, Cao, Su, & Chen, 2012). The organization is the secondary target of workplace citizenship with sportsmanship and civic virtue as its defining characteristics (Chahal & Mehta, 2010). Organ (1988) defines Sportsmanship as 'the pro-social absence of complaints, tolerating the inevitable inconveniences, and impositions of work without whining and grievances' (p. 60). Moreover, it is for the benefit and in consideration of others, while lack of complaints is a behaviour that shows patience and courtesy to clients. Organ, Podsakoff, and MacKenzie (2005) view civic virtue as awareness of an individual about how his/her actions affect other people. Civic virtue refers to the behaviour of taking part in the decision-making and political processes of the organization by encouraging positive change and raising one's voice constructively for its betterment. Chen et al. (2013) further argue that civic virtue is the noblest form of OCB as it involves the risk of negative repercussions.

Research also illustrates that OCB affects nurse behaviour outcomes such as turnover intention as a whole (Kim, Lee, & Choi, 2012; Tsai & Wu, 2010). However, no research has been conducted on the relationship of OCB with intentions to leave the organizations and current job as separate behavioural outcomes. Literature regarding the possibility of employees leaving their current jobs for other jobs within the same organization is scarce (Paillé & Grima, 2011). The primary objective of this study was to evaluate the relationship of nurses' OCB with their intentions to leave their current organization or move to other jobs within the organization. Furthermore, this study is aimed to improve our understanding regarding the separate nature of intentions to leave the organization and current job.

#### OCB and Organization based Turnover Intension (OBTI)

The investigation regarding the explanation of turnover intentions in nursing started when Lyons (1968) tried to evaluate the effects of nurses' attitudes and turnover. Later Martin (1979) presented a contextual model to explain employee turnover intentions in different fields including nurses. In addition, Meyer, Allen, and Smith (1993) empirically validated the effects of nurse occupational commitment on turnover intentions. However, the predictive influence of OCB on turnover explained by its discretionary characteristics was first recognized by X.-P. Chen, Hui, and Sego (1998). Paillé and Grima (2011) explain this phenomenon through the manifestation of diminishing OCB of those employees who are dissatisfied with their organization, yet they don't have alternative job opportunities within or outside their current organization: they consider it a less risky alternative to expressing their discontent through diminishing efforts at work. Lonsdale (2016) recently argued that the lack of ability of employees to display OCB is one of the primary indicators of withdrawal from their organizations. Recent research also shows that quitting the organization is the last stage of the withdrawal process. However, considerable literature regarding OCB supports the former view that reduction in OCB is the first step of the withdrawal process (Paillé & Grima, 2011). Furthermore, organizational identification also has an influence on the relationship between OCB and Intentions (Cho & Ryu, 2011). Researchers have reported a negative relationship between organizational identification and turnover intentions; while a positive relationship between organizational identification and OCB (Yu, Lou, Eng, Yang, & Lee, 2017).

Researchers have tried to distinguish between OCB towards organizations and OCB towards individuals and their relationship with intentions to leave the organizations. Aryee and Chay (2001) presented a

ISSN: 1475-7192

negative relationship between turnover intentions and OCB directed towards individuals and organizations. The theoretical work by Organ et al. (2005) also supports the view that both OCB directed towards individuals and organization would negatively affect turnover intentions. Coyne and Ong (2007) for the first time evaluated the effects of different forms of OCB with the intention to leave the organization. They reported no significant difference in relationships between OBTI across countries. However hierarchical regression analysis showed that only sportsmanship significantly predicted the variance in OBTI while the effects of courtesy, altruism, conscientiousness and civic virtue were not found to be significant. Most recently Yu et al. (2017), Watty-Benjamin and Udechukwu (2014), Yaghoubi, Salarzehi, and Moloudi (2013) and Schimmel, Johnston, and Stasio (2013) also support the results of Coyne and Ong. So based on these results we predict that:

H<sub>1</sub>: OCB is negatively related to organization based turnover intentions.

#### OCB and Job-based turnover intentions (JBTI)

A significant amount of literature is available that focuses on the relationship between OCB and OBTI, however, literature is scarce about the relationship between OCB and JBTI. The main difference between these two forms of turnover intentions is that the former focuses on employees leaving their organizations all together while the latter focuses on the employees' intentions to leave the current job position yet not leaving their organization. Studies have presented a positive relationship between nurses' job rotation and in-house transfers with OCB and similar variables (Kwon & Lee, 1999). Bolino and Turnley (2003) state a positive effect of job rotation as a willingness to go an extra mile for the organization. Jeon and Jeong (2016), in a sample of assembly line units, found that job rotation improved productivity, work satisfaction, and accident prevention. Dalton and Todor (1987) are of the same view, they state that 'changing jobs (transferring) within the organization may resolve dissatisfaction with one's work as readily as changing organizations (quitting)' (p. 705).

Researchers have also studied turnover intention under the intra-organizational perspective and suggest that transfers and job rotation can be used to reduce employee turnovers (Hayes et al., 2012; Krausz, Koslowsky, Shalom, & Elyakim, 1995; Parry, 2008). The intra-organizational perspective closely related to the size of the organization and level of employment, yet by studying different alternatives of withdrawal a better understanding of the relationship between OCB and employee retention can be attained. Dalton and Todor (1987, 1993) studied several models related with turnover and presented two main conclusions first higher number transfer and job opportunities within the organization decrease OBTI and second employees prefer job rotation and intra-organization transfer over turnover. Steel and Lounsbury (2009) argue that employee would think about leaving when the organization couldn't maintain his/her interest in the current job. It can be inferred that employees may prefer another job in the current organization before the actual turnover. Similarly, several authors have view lack of employee ability to display OCB as early onset of withdrawal behaviour. As Dalton and Todor (1987), argue that internal mobility reduced OBTI. It is important to evaluate the relationship of OCB with JBTI. As mentioned earlier studies on the direct relationship of OCB and JBTI are scare. We can find only one study by Bycio, Hackett, and Allen (1995) which reports a negative relationship between OCB and JBTI. So, based on the literature the following hypothesis is proposed

H<sub>2</sub>: OCB is negatively related to job-based turnover intentions.

DOI: 10.37200/IJPR/V24I8/PR280041

Received: 19 Jan 2020 | Revised: 06 Feb 2020 | Accepted: 12 Mar 2020

429

ISSN: 1475-7192

**Problem Statement** 

The relationship between Organizational Citizenship Behaviour (OCB) and Organization Based

Turnover Intentions (OBTI) has been extensively researched by extant literature. However, research studies

exploring the relationship between Organizational Citizenship Behaviour (OCB) and Job-Based Turnover

Intentions (JBTI) are still scarce. Specifically, in the nursing profession such studies are non-existent. Hence,

this study intends to fill this research gap.

**Research Questions** 

1. To what extant does the OCB of nurses affect their OTBI?

2. To what extant does the OCB of nurses affect their JTBI?

**Purpose of the Study** 

The purpose of this study is to investigate the relationship between OCB and OBTI as well as the

relationship between OCB and JBTI. In addition to distinguishing between OBTI and JBTI as well as

researching their relationship with the OCB of nurses, this study also intends to test the results of previous

studies conducted in other industries and to see if they hold true for the nursing profession as well.

II. RESEARCH METHODS

The survey instrument was sent through email to faculty members of nursing education institutes in

Pakistan. The faculty members were chosen, firstly as they have opportunities to join other nursing education

institutes or hospitals and secondly within their respective education institute they are a natural choice for other

medical positions because of their background in medicine or nursing. A team of 10 postgraduate research

students was given the task to collect email addresses of faculty members from nursing education institutes all

over Pakistan. A database of 467 faculty members was developed and was contacted among which 124

responded with a response rate of 26.53%.

The sample included 24 male and 100 female faculty members. Full-time permanent employees

constituted 66.8% of the sample while 33.2% were part-time contract employees. The average age was 32.6

(range = 25 to 56, SD=5.01). Average education in years was 16.01 years (SD=1.50) while average job

experience was 5.29 years (SD=3.79). 22 (17.4%) respondent had supervisory positions i.e. one or more than

employees directly report to them. The participant represented from both public and private sector nursing

education institutes. Social desirability bias (SDB) was taken into consideration keeping in view the nature of the

variables. Literature was searched regarding any evidence for SDB which wasn't found and the only minor

changes were made to the standardized items. Subjects anonymity was ensured during the data collection

process. Lastly, Mahalanobis distance statistics were used to identify any faking good response bias resulting in

two subjects which were eliminated. This study was approved the local institutional review board (Board of

studies, [BOS]) of the institute. The synopsis of the study was presented by the researchers to the said IRB

which was duly approved based on ethical consideration. Furthermore, the board of studies also ensured that the

study is performed in accordance with the Declaration of Helsinki. Before the survey was administered, the

purpose and process of the study, a guarantee of confidentiality, voluntary participation, the anonymity of data

and their right to discontinue participation at any time during the process were explained to the potential

DOI: 10.37200/IJPR/V24I8/PR280041

participants. The participants who decided to join in the survey completed a consent form. The survey instrument didn't include any information related to the respondent's personal identification to protect the participants' personal information. Lastly, the data was discarded once the study was finished.

#### **Measures**

Scales developed by Posdakoff and Mackenzie (1994)were used to measure OCB. The scale included four sub-scale first for helping behavior having three items  $\alpha = 0.83$ . Second altruism having three items  $\alpha = 0.72$ . The thirdsubscale had three items with the reported reliability of  $\alpha = 0.70$  measuring civic virtue. The last sub-scale measuring sportsmanship included four items having the reliability of  $\alpha = 0.75$ .

The organizational-based turnover intention was measured by a three-item scale ( $\alpha = 0.90$ ) developed by Lichtenstein, Alexander, McCarthy, and Wells (2004). Job-based turnover intentions were measured by three items developed by Paillé and Grima (2011) and reported reliability of  $\alpha = 0.76$ . Age and experience in years were the control behaviors of the study. All the items of the survey instrument were measured using 7 points Likert scale ranging from 1 strongly disagree to 7 strongly agree.

# III. RESULTS

As the data was collected through self-reported questionnaire Herman's one-factor test was used to detect the presence of common variance bias. No general factor surfaced during the Herman one factor test indicating acceptable common variance bias. Furthermore, confirmatory factor analysis (CFA) was executed on the items measuring OCB. The results of the study show that four-factor model (Helping; Civic Virtue; Sportsmanship; Altruism) has a good fit,  $\chi 2(59) = 109$ , p < 0.000,  $\chi 2/df=1.84$ , CFI=0.911, GFI=0.929, TLI=0.919, RMSEA=0.046.

2 Mean SD 1 3 5 6 ρ ρνς(η) α Altruism 4.44 1.23 0.82 0.69 0.77 0.52 Helping 4.19 1.01 0.78 0.85 0.31\*\* Civic virtue 3.47 1.12 0.73 0.51 0.82 0.05 0.23\*\* 1.19 0.53 0.88 -0.01Sportsmanship 3.54 0.75 0.04 0.04 OBTI 2.32 1.79 0.86 0.55 0.91 -0.10\*-0.15\*-0.16\*\*-0.58\*\*JBTI 1.78 0.77 -0.11\* 2.83 0.72 0.55 -0.13\*0.06 -0.37\*\*0.48\*\*

**Table 01.** Reliabilities and Descriptive Statistics of the study (N = 467)

OBTI= Organization based turnover intension

JBTI= Job based turnover intension

\*p < .05; \*\*p < .01

 $\rho$  = Jörekog's index of internal consistency reliability

Table 1 shows the correlation descriptive and reliability statistics of our study. Correlation between the independent and dependent variables is presented in tables 1. All the four variables of OCB are negatively correlated with OBTI. With JBTI Altruism, Helping and Sportsmanship are negatively correlated while the

relationship with Civic virtue is not significant. Sportsmanship has the strongest negative correlation value for both OBTI and JBTI.

To analyze the effects of control and independent variables hierarchical regression analysis was performed. Two models were developed for each facet of turnover intentions. In the first model, control variables age and experience in years were regressed with the dependent variables OBTI and JBTI. In the second model, both the control variables and OCB were used as predictors for OBTI and JBTI. The results of hierarchical regression are presented in table 2. The results of Model 1 for both OBTI and JBTI fails to explain significant amount of variance in OBTI (R2=0.011, p>0.05) and JBTI (R2=0.013, p>0.05). The model 2 including the control variables and OCB generated significant results for both OBTI (R2=0.31, p<0.01) and JBTI (R2=0.11, p<0.01).

Table 02. Hierarchical regressions

	OBTI		JBTI	
Predictors	Model 1	Model 2	Model 1	Model 2
Control				
Age	-0.023	0.002	-0.01	0.02
Experience	-0.025	-0.038	-0.05	-0.05
Independent				
Helping		-0.18*		-0.25*
Altruism		0.009		-0.12*
Civic Virtue		-0.13*		0.2*
Sportsmanship		-0.33**		-0.78**
$\mathbb{R}^2$	0.011	0.31**	0.013	0.11**
* p < .05; ** p	< .000	ı		1
ORTI- Organization based turnover intentions				

OBTI= Organization based turnover intentions

JBTI= Job based turnover intensions

To analyze the effects of control and independent variables hierarchical regression analysis was performed. Two models were developed for each facet of turnover intentions. In the first model, control variables age and experience in years were regressed with the dependent variables OBTI and JBTI. In the second model, both the control variables and OCB were used as predictors for OBTI and JBTI. The results of hierarchical regression are presented in table 3. The results of Model 1 for both OBTI and JBTI fails to explain significant amount of variance in OBTI (R2=0.011, p>0.05) and JBTI (R2=0.013, p>0.05). The model 2 including the control variables and OCB generated significant results for both OBTI (R2=0.31, p<0.01) and JBTI (R2=0.11, p<0.01).

Table 2 also provides insight into the relationship between different forms of OCB with OBTI and JBTI. It was proposed in H1 that a negative relationship exists between OCB and OBTI, which is supported by the results of the study. Helping behavior ( $\beta = -0.18$ , p <0.01), civic virtue ( $\beta = -0.13$ , p <0.01) and sportsmanship ( $\beta = -0.33$ , p < 0.01) have significant negative relationship with OCB. However, the relationship

ISSN: 1475-7192

was not significant for Altruism ( $\beta$  = 0.009, p > 0.05). H1 proposed a negative relationship between OCB and JBTI. All four forms of OCB had a negative and significant relationship (Altruism [ $\beta$  = -0.12, p < 0.05], Helping [ $\beta$  = -0.25, p < 0.05], Civic Virtue [ $\beta$  = -0.2, p < 0.05] and Sportsmanship [ $\beta$  = -0.78, p < 0.01]) with JBTI thus providing support for H2.

# IV. FINDINGS

As previous studies suggested a negative relationship between forms of nurses OCB with turnover intentions this study also presents similar results. However, we found a difference in the dynamics of these relationships between forms of OCB, OBTI, and JBTI. Helping behaviour has a stronger effect on JBTI ( $\beta$  = -0.25, p < .05) than OBTI ( $\beta$  = -0.18, p < .05). This result shows that if nursing education institutes develop a culture in which helping behaviours foster, nurses would not prefer alternative jobs within and outside the organization. Furthermore, it's also inferred that change in the level of helping behaviour affects the employee retention thus low level of helping behaviours in the organization would encourage employees to seek jobs outside the organization more than within the organization.

Until recently studies have presented a significant negative relationship between altruism and OBTI (Haynes, Josefy, & Hitt, 2015; Paillé, Raineri, & Valeau, 2015; Rim, Yang, & Lee, 2016). However, this study presents no significant relationship between altruism and OBTI. Coyne and Ong (2007) in their study, have presented a non-significant relationship similar to our study. Interestingly a significant relationship is reported by this study between altruism and JBTI ( $\beta = -0.12$ , p < .05). Paillé and Grima (2011) are of the view that nurses' ability to display behaviours that benefit the organization may diminish yet he/she may not want to detach him/herself from the individuals within their organization. Paillé and Grima further present altruism as a form of OCB which measures the proximity of an employee with other individuals within the organization. Shahjehan and Yasir (2015) have even presented a positive relationship between OCB directed towards individuals and withdrawal behaviours. They are of the view that employee can display behaviours that benefit individuals without concern for organizational benefit. Another possible explanation of this phenomenon is through Hofstede, Hofstede, and Minkov (1991) power distance index. Studies show that countries with high power distance index perceive OCB a part of their jobs (Cavazotte, Hartman, & Bahiense, 2013). For Pakistan, the PDI=55 which makes it difficult to determine a preference in this dimension, thus explaining why in nurses' altruism is related to JBTI and not related to OBTI.

The findings of this study also present a significant negative relationship between nurses' civic virtue and OBTI ( $\beta$  = -0.13, p < .05). Previous studies also support the results of our study (Al Sahi AL Zaabi, Ahmad, Hossan, & SINGH, 2016; Bellou, 2008; Vandewaa, Turnipseed, & Cain, 2016; Wan, 2016). Most importantly, this study presents a significant positive relationship between civic virtue and JBTI ( $\beta$  = 0.22, p < .05). This result replicates the positive relationship between civic virtue and JBTI reported by Paillé and Grima (2011), however, the relationship was significant at p= 0.07. As civic virtue is a relatively proactive form of OCB, an increase in its level leads to activities involving perceived positive changes in the current job. If for any reason, the nurse fails to bring change, he/she may want to change the current job without thinking about leaving the organization. A higher level of civic virtue results into greater involvement in organizational politics and governance, which keeps the employee informed about vacant higher or authoritative position within the

DOI: 10.37200/IJPR/V24I8/PR280041

Received: 19 Jan 2020 | Revised: 06 Feb 2020 | Accepted: 12 Mar 2020

433

ISSN: 1475-7192

organization thus increasing JBTI. Lastly, one or more than one variables not studied in the current study may be playing a mediating role between OCB and JBTI thus resulting in an unusual positive relationship.

Citizenship has emerged as the strongest predictor of both OBTI and JBTI. The study reports a strong negative relationship between sportsmanship and OBTI ( $\beta$  = -0.33, p < 0.01) consistent with the result of previous studies (Coyne & Ong, 2007; Paillé & Grima, 2011). For nurses, sportsmanship refers to enduring and tolerating the problems of the workforce environment without complaining and grievances and accepting it as an occasional extra effort(S. H. Chen, yu, hsu, lin, & lou, 2013). A stronger association between sportsmanship and JBTI ( $\beta$  = -0.78, p < 0.01) is reported in table 3. This inference suggests that nurses with a low level of sportsmanship would seek other jobs within the organization more than venturing outside the organization.

# **Practical Implications**

This study provides us with exciting practical implication especially in the area of employee retention in general and nurse retention in specific. The results of this study can help managers to understand turnover intentions and its OCB precursors. Similar to previous studies as OCB is voluntary and discretionary behaviour it can provide insights towards employee's withdrawal within the organization and can be used as a primary indicator of nurse's withdrawal intentions. Chen (2005) presents this phenomenon as 'OCB is discretionary and not explicitly recognized by the formal reward system, a person's lack of willingness to exhibit such behaviours may indicate his or her withdrawal from the organization' (p. 437). Furthermore, previous studies (X. Chen, 2005; X. P. Chen, Lam, Naumann, & Schaubroeck, 2005; Coyne & Ong, 2007; Paillé & Grima, 2011) and the current investigation clearly state the importance of OCB in predicting and foreseeing nurses intention to leave the organization. This study provides a clear distinction between organization and job-based turnover intentions. Based on this distinction it is recommended for the health managers to use OCB as an indicator of withdrawal behavior. It is also recommended that some results of this study point out to other latent variables that should be taken into account when making decisions and judgments regarding withdrawal behaviors in general and intentions to leave the organization and job in particular.

## **Study Limitations**

The first limitation of this study is the self-reporting nature of the measures of OCB. The phenomenon of social desirability can generate common variance bias that overestimates the results of the study. To counter the problem both practical and statistical measures have been taken in this study to limit the SDB. Second, the methodology and analysis of this study are causal in nature using correlations, but the purpose of this study was not to study the reciprocal relationship between OCB and turnover intentions. Third, this study is conducted in one country, which may raise some issues about the generalizability of this study in other countries. However, some of the results from studies conducted in other countries have been replicated. Last, this study examines turnovers intentions rather than actual turnover and it does not have the ability to calculate actual turnover. Nonetheless, this study provides insight into different facets of turnover intentions and possible their expositions.

#### **Future Perspective**

For future research, other typologies of OCB should be used to study its relationship with organization and job-based turnover intentions, for example, Smith, Organ, and Near (1983) proposes a two factor model of

ISSN: 1475-7192

General compliance and Altruism, Williams and Anderson (1991) two-factor model stating that OCB is either directed towards the organization (OCB-O) or towards individuals (OCB-I) and lastly Van Scotterand Motowidlo (1996) typology including two facets of OCB; interpersonal facilitation and job dedication. Like any form of voluntary behavior is positively related to organizational commitment; in future studies, the impact of its different forms on the relationship of OCB, OBTI, and JBTI would be intriguing. Affective commitment to the organization is recognized as the individual variable that is the best predictor of employee departure(Vandenberghe& Bentein, 2009). A high level of affective commitment diminishes the probability that nurses will leave and join other organizations. Furthermore, citizenship may be viewed as signalling a high level of commitment. Most recently motives based organizational voice has been used to predict both withdrawal and citizenship behavior(Shahjehan & Yasir, 2016). The moderating relationship of organization voice would also present an interesting insight into the relationship between OCB and turnover intention.

# V. CONCLUSION

The primary objective of this study was to improve our understanding of the relationship between nurses' organizational citizenship behavior and organization and job-based turnover intentions. This study makes a significant contribution to the extant literature as it adds an empirical finding to the existing body of knowledge. It also provides insight into the effects of different forms of OCB on OBTI and JBTI such as sportsmanship being the most significant predictor, altruism significantly affects JBTI but not OBTI, helping behavior predicts JBTI than OBTI, and civic virtue has a negative relationship with OBTI while a positive relationship with JBTI. Most importantly, a preliminary distinction between OBTI and JBTI is established in this study. Thus, this study sets the research direction as discussed above, and which needs to elaborate and studied in future research.

### REFERENCES

- 1. Al Sahi AL Zaabi, M. S., Ahmad, K. Z., Hossan, C., & SINGH, S. (2016). Authentic leadership, work engagement and organizational citizenship behaviors in petroleum company. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, 65(6).
- 2. Aryee, S., & Chay, Y. W. (2001). Workplace justice, citizenship behavior, and turnover intentions in a union context: examining the mediating role of perceived union support and union instrumentality. *Journal of applied psychology*, 86(1), 154.
- 3. Bellou, V. (2008). Exploring civic virtue and turnover intention during organizational changes. *Journal of Business Research*, 61(7), 778-789.
- 4. Bolino, M. C., & Turnley, W. H. (2003). Going the extra mile: Cultivating and managing employee citizenship behavior. *The Academy of Management Executive*, 17(3), 60-71.
- 5. Bycio, P., Hackett, R. D., & Allen, J. S. (1995). Further assessments of Bass's (1985) conceptualization of transactional and transformational leadership. *Journal of applied psychology*, 80(4), 468.
- 6. Cavazotte, F., Hartman, N. S., & Bahiense, E. (2013). Charismatic leadership, citizenship behaviors, and power distance orientation: Comparing Brazilian and US workers. *Cross-Cultural Research*, 1069397113494687.
- 7. Chahal, H., & Mehta, S. (2010). Antecedents and consequences of organisational citizenship behaviour (OCB): A conceptual framework in reference to health care sector. *Journal of Services Research*, 10(2), 25
- 8. Chang, C. S. (2014). Moderating Effects of Nurses' Organizational Justice Between Organizational Support and Organizational Citizenship Behaviors for Evidence-Based Practice. *Worldviews on Evidence-Based Nursing*, 11(5), 332-340.
- 9. Chen, S. H., yu, h. y., hsu, h. y., lin, f. c., & lou, j. h. (2013). Organisational support, organisational identification and organisational citizenship behaviour among male nurses. *Journal of nursing management*, 21(8), 1072-1082.

DOI: 10.37200/IJPR/V24I8/PR280041

ISSN: 1475-7192

- 10. Chen, X.-P., Hui, C., & Sego, D. J. (1998). The role of organizational citizenship behavior in turnover: Conceptualization and preliminary tests of key hypotheses. *Journal of applied psychology*, 83(6), 922.
- 11. Chen, X. (2005). Organizational citizenship behavior: A predictor of employee voluntary turnover. *Handbook of organizational citizenship behavior*, 435-454.
- 12. Chen, X. P., Lam, S. S., Naumann, S. E., & Schaubroeck, J. (2005). Group citizenship behaviour: Conceptualization and preliminary tests of its antecedents and consequences. *Management and Organization Review*, 1(2), 273-300.
- 13. Cho, Y. B., & Ryu, J. R. (2011). Organizational Citizenship Behaviors In Relation To Job Embeddedness, Organizational Identification, Job Performance, Voluntary Turnover Intention In Korea. *International Business & Economics Research Journal (IBER)*, 8(7).
- 14. Chu, C.-I., Lee, M.-S., Hsu, H.-M., & Chen, I.-C. (2005). Clarification of the Antecedents of Hospital Nurse Organizational Citizenship Behavior-An Example From a Taiwan Regional Hospital. *Journal of Nursing Research*, 13(4), 313-324.
- 15. Coyne, I., & Ong, T. (2007). Organizational citizenship behaviour and turnover intention: a cross-cultural study. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management, 18*(6), 1085-1097.
- 16. Dalton, D. R., & Todor, W. D. (1987). The attenuating effects of internal mobility on employee turnover: Multiple field assessments. *Journal of Management*, *13*(4), 705-711.
- 17. Hayes, L. J., O'Brien-Pallas, L., Duffield, C., Shamian, J., Buchan, J., Hughes, F., . . . North, N. (2012). Nurse turnover: a literature review—an update. *International journal of nursing studies*, 49(7), 887-905.
- 18. Haynes, K. T., Josefy, M., & Hitt, M. A. (2015). Tipping Point Managers' Self-Interest, Greed, and Altruism. *Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies*, 1548051815585171.
- 19. Hofstede, G., Hofstede, G. J., & Minkov, M. (1991). *Cultures and organizations: Software of the mind* (Vol. 2): Citeseer.
- 20. Jeon, I. S., & Jeong, B. Y. (2016). Effect of Job Rotation Types on Productivity, Accident Rate, and Satisfaction in the Automotive Assembly Line Workers. *Human Factors and Ergonomics in Manufacturing & Service Industries*.
- 21. Kim, E. H., Lee, E., &Choi, H. J. (2012). Mediation effect of organizational citizenship behavior between job embeddedness and turnover intention in hospital nurses. *Journal of Korean Academy of Nursing Administration*, 18(4), 394-401.
- 22. Krausz, M., Koslowsky, M., Shalom, N., & Elyakim, N. (1995). Predictors of intentions to leave the ward, the hospital, and the nursing profession: A longitudinal study. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, *16*(3), 277-288.
- 23. Kwon, Y.-H., & Lee, M.-H. (1999). Performance Appraisal and Job Rotation of the Nurse In a General Hospital. *Journal of Korean Academy of Nursing Administration*, 5(3), 425-444.
- 24. Lonsdale, D. J. (2016). The effects of leader–member exchange and the feedback environment on organizational citizenship and withdrawal. *The Psychologist-Manager Journal*, 19(1), 41.
- 25. Lv, A., Shen, X., Cao, Y., Su, Y., & Chen, X. (2012). Conscientiousness and organizational citizenship behavior: The mediating role of organizational justice. *Social Behavior and Personality: an international journal*, 40(8), 1293-1300.
- 26. Lyons, T. F. (1968). Nursing attitudes and turnover. Ames, Iowa: Industrial Relations Center.
- 27. Martin, T. N. (1979). A contextual model of employee turnover intentions. *Academy of management Journal*, 22(2), 313-324.
- 28. Meyer, J. P., Allen, N. J., & Smith, C. A. (1993). Commitment to organizations and occupations: Extension and test of a three-component conceptualization. *Journal of applied psychology*, 78(4), 538.
- 29. Organ, D. W. (1988). *Organizational citizenship behavior: The good soldier syndrome*. Lexington, Massachusetts: Lexington Books/DC Heath and Com.
- 30. Organ, D. W., Podsakoff, P. M., & MacKenzie, S. B. (2005). *Organizational citizenship behavior: Its nature, antecedents, and consequences:* Sage Publications.
- 31. Paillé, P., & Grima, F. (2011). Citizenship and withdrawal in the workplace: Relationship between organizational citizenship behavior, intention to leave current job and intention to leave the organization. *The Journal of Social Psychology*, 151(4), 478-493.
- 32. Paillé, P., Raineri, N., & Valeau, P. J. (2015). Professional Employee Retention: Examining The Relationships Between Organizational Citizenship Behavior And Turnover Cognitions. *Journal of Applied Business Research*, 31(4), 1437.
- 33. Parry, J. (2008). Intention to leave the profession: antecedents and role in nurse turnover. *Journal of advanced nursing*, 64(2), 157-167.
- 34. Podsakoff, P. M., MacKenzie, S. B., Paine, J. B., & Bachrach, D. G. (2000). Organizational citizenship behaviors: A critical review of the theoretical and empirical literature and suggestions for future research. *Journal of Management*, 26(3), 513-563.

- 35. Rim, H., Yang, S.-U., & Lee, J. (2016). Strategic partnerships with nonprofits in corporate social responsibility (CSR): The mediating role of perceived altruism and organizational identification. *Journal of Business Research*, 69(9), 3213-3219.
- 36. Schimmel, T., Johnston, P. C., & Stasio, M. (2013). Can" collegiality" be measured?: Further validation of a faculty assessment model of discretionary behaviors. *Research in Higher Education Journal*, 21, 1.
- 37. Shahjehan, A., & Yasir, M. (2015). Moderating Effect Of Organizational Identification On The Relationship Between Organizational Silence, Organizational Voice And Organizational Citizenship Behaviors. *Gomal University Journal of Research*, 31(2), 41-52.
- 38. Shahjehan, A., & Yasir, M. (2016). Surface and deep conceptualizations of silence and voice paradoxes: An empirical analysis of women behavior at workplace. *Cogent Business & Management*, *3*(1), 1221560.
- 39. Steel, R. P., & Lounsbury, J. W. (2009). Turnover process models: Review and synthesis of a conceptual literature. *Human Resource Management Review*, 19(4), 271-282.
- 40. Tsai, Y., & Wu, S. W. (2010). The relationships between organisational citizenship behaviour, job satisfaction and turnover intention. *Journal of Clinical Nursing*, 19(23-24), 3564-3574.
- 41. Van Scotter, J. R., & Motowidlo, S. J. (1996). Interpersonal facilitation and job dedication as separate facets of contextual performance. *Journal of applied psychology*, 81(5), 525.
- 42. Vandenberghe, C., & Bentein, K. (2009). A closer look at the relationship between affective commitment to supervisors and organizations and turnover. *Journal of Occupational and Organizational Psychology*, 82(2), 331-348.
- 43. Vandewaa, E. A., Turnipseed, D. L., & Cain, G. (2016). Panacea Or Placebo? An Evaluation Of The Value Of Emotional Intelligence In Healthcare Workers. *Journal of health and human services administration*, 38(4), 438.
- 44. Wan, H. L. (2016). Organisational Justice—Organisational Citizenship Behaviour *Organisational Justice* and Citizenship Behaviour in Malaysia (pp. 179-205): Springer.
- 45. Watty-Benjamin, W., & Udechukwu, I. (2014). The Relationship Between HRM Practices and Turnover Intentions: A Study of Government and Employee Organizational Citizenship Behavior in the Virgin Islands. *Public Personnel Management*, 0091026013508546.
- 46. Yaghoubi, N.-M., Salarzehi, H., & Moloudi, J. (2013). The relationship between human resource productivity (HRP) and organizational citizenship behavior (OCB). *African Journal of Business Management*, 7(32), 3168.
- 47. Yoo, M.-R., Yoo, J.-A., & Kim, Y.-M. (2012). Study for professionalism, organizational citizenship behavior, psychological ownership of nurse officers. *Journal of Korean Academy of Nursing Administration*, 18(3), 290-300.
- 48. Yu, H.-Y., Lou, J.-H., Eng, C.-J., Yang, C.-I., & Lee, L.-H. (2017). Organizational citizenship behaviour of men in nursing professions: Career stage perspectives. *Collegian*.
- 49. Dawi, N. M., Jusoh, A., Nor, K. M., & Qureshi, M. I. (2016). Service quality dimensions in pay TV industry: A preliminary study. *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 6(4), 239–249. Retrieved from https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-84970005749&partnerID=40&md5=eb2f80218b5a66eb71b25a6d0dd97cab
- 50. Faiza, S., Shyamala, B. N., Oghbaei, M., & Prakash, J. (2015). Formulation of nutritious premixes based on natural ingredients and evaluating their efficacy for value addition. *International Food Research Journal*, 22(2), 546–555. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-014-3584-2
- 51. Haider, S., Shah, A., Abbas, S. G., Qureshi, M. I., & Lumpur, U. K. (2016). Impact of HR Practices and Turnover Intentions in banking sector of. *Abasyn Journal of Social Sciences*, (Special Issue), 415–433.
- 52. Harasis, A. A., Qureshi, M. I., & Rasli, A. (2018). Development of research continuous usage intention of e-commerce. A systematic review of literature from 2009 to 2015. *International Journal of Engineering and Technology(UAE)*, 7(2), 73–78. https://doi.org/10.14419/ijet.v7i2.29.13133
- 53. Hashemijoo, M., Mahdavi Ardekani, A., & Younesi, N. (2012a). The Impact of Dividend Policy on Share Price Volatility in the Malaysian Stock Market. *Journal of Business Studies Quarterly*, 4(38), 111–129. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.lib.monash.edu.au/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=bth&AN=91711854&site=ehost-live&scope=site
- 54. Hashemijoo, M., Mahdavi Ardekani, A., & Younesi, N. (2012b). The Impact of Dividend Policy on Share Price Volatility in the Malaysian Stock Market. *Journal of Business Studies Quarterly*, 4(38), 111–129. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.lib.monash.edu.au/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=bth&AN=91711854&site=ehost-live&scope=site
- 55. Hishan, S. S., Ramakrishnan, S., Manokaran, K. R., Jusoh, A., Qureshi, M. I., Idris, N., & others. (2018). Flood Disaster Management as A CSR Agenda for the Malaysian Listed Companies. *The Journal of*

ISSN: 1475-7192

- Social Sciences Research, (SPI 2), 477–482. https://doi.org/10.32861/jssr.spi2.477.482
- 56. Hishan, S. S., Sasmoko, Khan, A., Ahmad, J., Hassan, Z. Bin, Zaman, K., & Qureshi, M. I. (2019). Access to clean technologies, energy, finance, and food: environmental sustainability agenda and its implications on Sub-Saharan African countries. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 26(16), 16503–16518. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-019-05056-7
- 57. Ibrahim, Z. L., Khan, A., Ramli, J. Bin, & Qureshi, I. M. (2019). Relationship among vocational preference, self concept and educational needs of married women in women center for continuing education, sokoto state of nigeria. *Indian Journal of Public Health Research and Development*, 10(6), 1330–1335. https://doi.org/10.5958/0976-5506.2019.01481.5
- 58. Iftikhar, M., & Qureshi, M. I. (2015). Modeling the Workplace Bullying the Mediator of "Workplace Climate-Employee Health― Relationship. *Journal of Management Info.* https://doi.org/10.31580/jmi.v4i1.27
- 59. Iftikhar, M., Shahid, M. U., Shahab, M. H., Mobeen, M., & Qureshi, M. I. (2016). Exploring the relationship among organizational citizenship behavior, psychological empowerment and turnover intensions with the mediating role of affective commitment. *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 6(4), 296–304.
- 60. Imran, Q. (n.d.). M., Zaman, K., & Nazir B, M.(2011). The impact of culture and gender on leadership behavior: Higher education and management perspective. *Management Science Letters*, *1*(4), 531–540.
- 61. Irfan, A., Rasli, A., Sulaiman, Z., Sami, A., Liaquat, H., & Qureshi, M. I. (2020). Student's perceived university image is an antecedent of university reputation. *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation*, 24(1), 650–663. https://doi.org/10.37200/IJPR/V24I1/PR200170
- 62. Irfan, A., Rasli, A., Sulaiman, Z., Sami, A., & Qureshi, M. I. (2018). Use of social media sites by Malaysian universities and its impact on university ranking. *International Journal of Engineering and Technology(UAE)*, 7(4), 67–71. https://doi.org/10.14419/ijet.v7i4.28.22393
- 63. Irfan, A., Rasli, A., Sulaiman, Z., Sami, A., & Qureshi, M. I. (2019). The Influence of Social Media on Public Value: A Systematic Review of Past Decade. *Journal of Public Value and Administration Insights*, 2(1), 1–6. https://doi.org/10.31580/jpvai.v2i1.481
- 64. Irum, S., Imran Qureshi, M., Ashfaq, M., Sami, A., N. Bhatti, M., & Umar, A. (2018). A Review of Green Supply Chain Management Practices in Asian Countries. *International Journal of Engineering & Technology*, 7(2.29), 1094. https://doi.org/10.14419/ijet.v7i2.29.14319
- 65. Jaafar, J. B., Ishak, A. N. B., Hassan, S. Bin, Adrutdin, K. F. Bin, & Qureshi, M. I. (2020). A study of customer satisfaction with planning movement of goods during disaster aid programs: A case study of flood hit in segamat, johor. *Journal of Environmental Treatment Techniques*, 8(1), 419–428.
- 66. Jamal, A., & Naser, K. (2003). Factors influencing customer satisfaction in the retail banking sector in Pakistan. *International Journal of Commerce and Management*, 13(2), 29–53. https://doi.org/10.1108/eb047465
- 67. Jamil, F., Ismail, K., Mahmood, N., Khan, N. U., & Siddique, M. (2015). Technology incubators and institutional development. *Jurnal Teknologi*, 77(23), 113–120. https://doi.org/10.11113/jt.v77.6702
- 68. Jamil, F., Ismail, K., Siddique, M., Khan, M. M., Kazi, A. G., & Qureshi, M. I. (2016). Business incubators in Asian developing countries. *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 6(4), 291–295. Retrieved from http://www.econjournals.com/index.php/irmm/article/view/2501%5Cnhttps://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-84970027707&partnerID=40&md5=a904b3fa81db30b067742e8da83d9f72
- 69. Jamil, R. A., Iftikhar, M., Arif, S., Bibi, S., Qureshi, M. I., & Zaman, K. (2012). A survey of student perceptions of team-based learning: assessment of Pakistan and UK students. *Elixir Mgmt. Arts*, *50*, 10475–10479.
- 70. Kota, S.K., Kota, S.K., Meher, L.K., Sahoo, S., Mohapatra, S., Modi, K.D.Surgical revascularization techniques for diabetic foot(2013) Journal of Cardiovascular Disease Research, 4 (2), pp. 79-83. DOI: 10.1016/j.jcdr.2012.10.002
- 71. Thamarai, P., Adalarasu, K.An effective method to remove noise in EEG signal using wavelet packet transform(2018) International Journal of Pharmaceutical Research, 10 (4), pp. 793-799. https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2s2.085062401962&partnerID=40&md5=4364f50cfe8fa 13d7c6f428ce119748b
- 72. Patel DM, Jani RH, Patel CN. "Ufasomes: A Vesicular Drug Delivery." Systematic Reviews in Pharmacy 2.2 (2011), 72-78. Print. doi:10.4103/0975-8453.86290